#### L Duties of Care

## Risk of Harm

## 142A At all material times:

- a) there was a risk that a failure properly to conduct Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam would reduce the available flood storage capacity of Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe during times of flood and necessitate the release of water from Wivenhoe Dam in such volumes as to cause the inundation of real and personal property located downstream of Wivenhoe Dam by water (or increase the extent of such inundation), resulting in damage to that real or personal property (or increased damage to such property) (Risk of Harm to Property):
- b) there was a risk that a failure properly to conduct Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam would reduce the available flood storage capacity of Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe during times of flood and necessitate the release of water from Wivenhoe Dam in such volumes as to cause the inundation of real property located downstream of Wivenhoe Dam (or increase the extent of such inundation), and that the inundation so caused would interfere with the use or enjoyment of that real property by persons holding an interest in that property (Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment): and
- c) there was a risk that a failure properly to conduct Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam would reduce the available flood storage capacity of Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe during times of flood and necessitate the release of water from Wivenhoe Dam in such volumes as to cause the inundation of areas located downstream of Wivenhoe Dam (or increase the extent of such inundation), and that such inundation would impede or disrupt the commercial activities of businesses or enterprises located downstream of Wivenhoe Dam resulting in economic loss to those businesses or enterprises (Risk of Harm to Businesses).

142B Each of the Risk of Harm to Property, the Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment and the Risk of Harm to Businesses was not remote or insignificant.

## Segwater's Duty of Care as Owner and Occupier

- 143 In December 2010 and January 2011:
  - a) each of the Risk of Harm to Property. Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment and Risk of Harm to Businesses was reasonably foreseeable by Segwater:

# **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Segwater. Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u> Copy. September 2010.
- B. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4. 8.4.
- C. Further particulars may be provided after discovery.
- b) Segwater, as owner and occupier of Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe

  Dam, was engaged in an inherently dangerous activity, being the

  conduct of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam:
- c) the conduct of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe

  Dam was an extremely hazardous activity which carried with it the
  risk of harm to at least 244.000 people located downstream of
  Wivenhoe Dam:

#### **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Segwater, Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u> <u>Copy, September 2010, p 5.</u>
- d) Segwater had actual knowledge of the Risk of Harm to Property. Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment and Risk of Harm to Businesses:

# **PARTICULARS**

A. <u>Segwater. Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u> Copy. September 2010. p 5.

- B. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1. 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- C. Further particulars may be provided after discovery.
- e) the location and identity of persons and businesses likely to be directly impacted by a failure by Segwater properly to conduct Flood Operations at Wivenhoe Dam was reasonably ascertainable;

- A. <u>Segwater, Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u> <u>Copy, September 2010, p 5.</u>
- B. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- C. Further particulars may be provided after discovery.
- f) Segwater had the legal right (bv operation of ss 107 and 107A of the Water Act, the Segwater ROL and the August 2010 Interim Program), and practical ability, to exercise a high degree of control in relation to the operation of Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam so as to avoid the Risk of Harm to Property. Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment and Risk of Harm to Businesses:
- g) Segwater knew, or ought reasonably to have known, that it was the only entity licensed under s 107A of the Water Act (or any other statutory provision) to conduct Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam:
- h) Segwater had the means to make useful predictions as to the range of weather conditions that might affect Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam (including predictions as to the effects of actual and forecast rainfall), and to use those predictions and the Real Time Flood Model to operate Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam in a manner so as to avoid the Risk of Harm to Property, Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment and Risk of Harm to Businesses:

## **PARTICULARS**

A. <u>Segwater was able to make useful predictions as to the range of weather conditions that might affect Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam by reason of:</u>

- 1. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 106A-106B;
- 2. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 133 to 142:
- 3. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 158(d)-(f), 163A-163H, 174(e)-(q), 179A-179I, 192-194, 214-217, 231-234, 248-250, 270-273, 291-293, 310-315;
- 4. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 200-202: and
- the matters pleaded in paragraphs 151, 158(c), 164-165.
   174(d). 180-182, 196-198, 218-219, 235-236, 251-252, 274-275, 294-295, 316-318.
- i) the plaintiff and other Group Members could not direct, control or influence the manner in which Segwater conducted Flood Operations at Somerset Dam or Wivenhoe Dam;
- j) the plaintiff and other Group Members had no ability, or alternatively, no practical ability, to protect themselves from the Risk of Harm to Property, the Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment or the Risk of Harm to Businesses:
- k) the plaintiff and other Group Members were dependent upon

  Segwater taking reasonable care to avoid the Risk of Harm to

  Property, Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and Risk of

  Harm to Businesses: and
- I) the plaintiff and other Group Members were accordingly highly vulnerable to harm from the manner in which Segwater exercised its rights and powers as owner, occupier and licensed operator of Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam.
- a) it-was-roasonably-forosooablo-by-Sogwator:
  - i) that-a-failure-properly-to-conduct-Flood-Operations-at-Somerset
     Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-may-cause:
    - (1) flooding-downstream-of-Wivenhoe-Dam-in-eircumstances
      whore-such-flooding-would-not-have-otherwise-occurred-if
      -Flood-Operations-wore-conducted-properly;-or

(2) greater-flooding-downstream-of-Wivonhoo-Dam-than would-occur-if-Flood-Operations-woro-conducted-proporly;

(both-aro-roferred-to-in-this-pleading-for-oonvenionoo-as "Greater-Flooding");

- ii) that tho making of roloasos of water from Wivonhoo Dam at volumes-significantly in excess of those that would have been necessary if Flood-Operations wore conducted properly may cause Groater Flooding downstream of Wivonhoo Dam;
- iii) that if Groator Flooding-woro -caused-by-a-failure-proporly-to conduct-Flood-Operations-at-Somerset-Dam-and-Wivonhoo Dam- that flooding-may-cause-physical-damage-to-proportios located-downstream-of Wivonhoo-Dam-than-would-occur if Flood-Operations-woro-eenducted-proporly;
- iv) that tho -properties that -would -bo -damaged -by -such-Groator
   Flooding-may-include-thoso-proportios -located -downstroam-of
   Wivonhoo-Dam;

- A. Sogwator, *Wivonhoo-Dam-Emergency-Action-Plan*, Uncontrolled Copy, September 2010.
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections-1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- C. Further-particulars-may-bo-provided-after-discovery.
  - v) that-if-Groator-Flooding-woro-causod-by-a-failure-proporly-to conduct-Flood-Operations-at-Semerset-Dam-and-Wivonhoo Dam-that-flooding-may-disrupt-tho-commercial-activities-of businossos-oporating-from-ono-or-more-locations-looatod downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;
  - vi) that the businesses DO-disrupted-would-include-those businesses-operating-at-locations-located-downstream-of Wivenhoo-Dam;

- A. Segwater, *Wivonhoo-Dam-Emergency-Action-Plan*, Uncontrolled Copy, September 2010.
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- C. Further-particulars-may-bo-provided-aftor-discovery
  - vii) that-Groator -Flooding -causod -by-a-failuro-proporly-to-conduct -Flood-Oporations-at-<del>Somerset</del>-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-may -cause-loss-or-damage-to:
    - (1) persons-who-hold-an-interest-in-land-located-downstroam of-Wivonhoo-Dam;
    - (2) persons-who-owned-personal-property-that-was-located downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;-and
    - (3) persons-who-regularly-conducted-a-business-or enterprise, in-whole-or-in-part, at-ono-or-more-locations located-downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;

including-tho-plaintiff-and-Group-Members;

- viii) that,—if-Segwator-ongagod-any-other-person-to-conduct-Flood
  Operations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivenhoe-Dam,—a-failuro-by
  Segwator-to-onsuro-that-that-person-exercised-reasonable-care
  in-the-conduct-of-such-Flood-Operations-could-cause-tho-loss-or
  damage-described-in-(i)-to-(vii)-above-
- b) tho-risk-of-harm-of-tho-typos-doscribod-in-subparagraphs-(a)(i)-through-(a)(viii)-was-not-remote-or-insignificant;
- c) tho-plaintiff-and-other-Group-Mombors-had-no-ability,-or-altornativoly, no-practical-ability,-to-protect-thomsolvos-from-tho-harm-described-in subparagraphs-(a)(i)-through-(a)(viii)-in-tho-ovont-that-Segwater:
  - i) failod-proporly-to-conduct-Flood-Operations-at-Somerset-Dam and-Wivenhoe-Dam;-or
  - ii) failed-to-onsuro-that-any-porson-engaged-by-Sogwater-to conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somerset-Dam-and-Wivonhoo

52

Dam-exercised-reasonable care in the conduct-of-such-Flood Operations;

- d) Seqwater, as ownor-and-oooupier-of-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoe

  Dam, was-ongagod-in-an-inherently dangerous-activity, being tho

  conduct-of-Flood-Oporations-at-Somerset-Dam-and-Wivenhoe-Dam;
- e) tho-conduct-of-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoe Dam-was-an-extremely-hazardous-activity-which-carried-with-it-the risk-of-harm-to-at-least-244,000-pooplo-located-downstroam-of Wivenhoe-Dam:

## **PARTICULARS**

- D. Sogwator, Wivenhoe-Dam-Emergency-Action-Plan, Uncontrolled Copy, September 2010, p-5.
- f) Sogwator-had-actual-knowlodgo-of-risk-of-harm-posod-to-porsons-and businossos-locatod-downstream-of-Wivonhoe-Dam-(including-porsons in-tho-position-of-tho-plaintiff-and-other-Group-Members)-from-the conduct-of-Flood-Operations-at-Somerset-Dam-and-Wivenhoe-Dam;

# **PARTICULARS**

- A. Sogwator,—*Wivenhoe-Dam-Emergency Action-Plan*, Uncontrolled Copy,—Soptombor-<del>2010.</del>
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- C. Further-particulars-may-bo-provided-after-discovery-
- g) tho-location-and-identity-of-porsons-and-businossos-likely-to-bo
  directly-impacted-by-a-failuro-by-Sogwator-properly-to-conduct-Flood
  Oporations-at-Wivonhoe-Dam-was-reasonably-ascertainable;

- A. Sogwator, Wivenhoe-Dam-Emergency Action-Plan, Uncontrolled Copy, Soptombor 2010.
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, A, 8.4.
- C. Further-particulars-may-bo-provided-after-discovery.

- h) Sogwator-had-tho-legal-right-(by-oporation-of-ss-107-and-107A of the Wator-Act,-tho-Sogwator-RQL-and-tho-December-2010-Interim

  Program),-and-practical-ability,-to-oxoroiso-a-high-dogroo-of-control-in relation-to-the-oporation-of-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-so-as to-avoid-tho-risk-that-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and Wivonhoe-Dam-would-eause-Groator-Flooding-downstream-of Wivenhoe-Dam;
- i) Sogwator-know,-or-ought-roasonably to havo-known,-that-it-was-tho only-entity-licensed-under-s-107A-of-tho-Water-Act-(or-any-other statutory-provision)-to-conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot-Dam and-Wivenhoe-Dam:
- j) Sogwater had the means to make useful predictions as to the range of weather conditions that might affect Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam (including predictions as to the effects of actual and forecast rainfall), and to use those predictions and the Real Time Flood Model to operate Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam in a manner so as to the risk of Greater Flooding downstream of Wivenhoe Dam;
- k) tho-plaintiff and other Group -Members -could -not direct, -control -or influence-tho-manner in-which-Sogwator-oonduotod-Flood-Oporations at-Somerset-Dam-or-Wivenhoe-Dam;
- I) tho-plaintiff-and-othor-Group-Mombors-woro-dependent-upon Sogwater-taking-reasonable-care-to-avoid-the-risk-that-a-failure proporly-to-conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somerset-Dam-and Wivonhoe-Dam-would-causo-Groator-Flooding-downstroam-of Wivonhoe-Dam;-and-
- m) tho-plaintiff-and-othor-Group-Mombors-woro-accordingly-highly vulnorablo-to-harm-from-tho-mannor-in-which-Sogwator exercised-its rights-and-powers-as-owner-and-licensed-operator-of-Somorset-Damand-Wivenhoo-Dam.
- 144 In light of the facts and matters pleaded in paragraphs 142A-143,

  Segwater, in its capacity as owner and occupier of Somerset Dam and
  Wivenhoe Dam, owed a direct (or "personal" or "non-delegable") duty to
  Group Members:

- a) to take reasonable care in the conduct of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam; and
- to ensure that reasonable care was taken by any third party engaged by or on behalf of Segwater to conduct Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam;
- to avoid each of the Risk of Harm to Property, the Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and the Risk of Harm to Businesses (Seawater's Duty as Owner and Occupier). tho-risk-that-a-failuro-properly-to-conduct-Flood Operations-at-Semerset-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-would-causo-Groator Flooding-downstream-of-Wivonhoe-Dam-(Seqwater's-Duty-as-Owner-and Occupier).

## Segwater's Direct Duty of Care as Sole Licensee under the Water Act

Further, and in the alternative, in light of the facts and matters pleaded in paragraphs 61-76 and <a href="mailto:142A-143">142A-143</a>. Segwater, as the sole entity licensed to conduct Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam under s 107A of the Water Act, had a direct ("personal" or "non-delegable") duty to Group Members to take reasonable care in the operation of Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam to avoid <a href="mailto:each of the Risk of Harm to Property">each of the Risk of Harm to Property</a>, the Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and the Risk of Harm to <a href="mailto:Businesses">Businesses</a> (Seawater's Duty as Licensee), risk-that-a-failuro-proporly-to conduct-Flood-Operations-at-Somersot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-would cause-Groator-Flooding-downstream-of-Wivonhoo-Dam-(Seqwater's-Duty as-Licensee).

## 146 Segwater's Duty as Licensee:

- a) reguired that Segwater act personally (including through its employees) in conducting Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam; and
- could not be discharged by the delegation by Segwater of its responsibility for conducting Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam to third parties (including SunWater).

# Sun Water's Direct Duty of Care

- 147 In December 2010 and January 2011:
  - a) each of the Risk of Harm to Property. Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and Risk of Harm to Businesses was reasonably foreseeable by SunWater:

## **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Segwater, Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u>
  <u>Copy. September 2010.</u>
- B. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- C. <u>Further particulars may be provided after discovery.</u>
- b) SunWater. as the entity in practical control of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam, was engaged in an inherently dangerous activity, being the conduct of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam:
- c) the conduct of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe

  Dam by SunWater was an extremely hazardous activity which carried

  with it the risk of harm to at least 244,000 people located downstream
  of Wivenhoe Dam:

## **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Segwater. Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan. Uncontrolled</u> Copy. September 2010, p 5.
- d) SunWater had actual knowledge of the Risk of Harm to Property, Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment and Risk of Harm to Businesses:

- A. <u>Flood Management Services Agreement. Service Schedule</u>, clause 1.
- B. <u>Segwater. Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u>
  <u>Copy. September 2010.</u>

- C. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- D. <u>Further particulars will be provided by way of correspondence after discovery.</u>
- e) the location and identity of persons and businesses likely to be directly impacted by a failure by SunWater properly to conduct Flood Operations at Wivenhoe Dam was reasonably ascertainable:

- A. <u>Flood Management Services Agreement. Service Schedule</u>, <u>clause 1.</u>
- B. <u>Segwater, Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u>
  <u>Copv. September 2010.</u>
- C. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- D. Further particulars will be provided by way of correspondence after discovery.
- f) SunWater had the practical ability to exercise a high degree of control in relation to the operation of Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam so as to avoid the Risk of Harm to Property, Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and Risk of Harm to Businesses:
- g) SunWater had the means to make useful predictions as to the range of weather conditions that might affect Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam (including predictions as to the effects of actual and forecast rainfall), and to use those predictions and the Real Time Flood Model to operate Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam in a manner so as to avoid minimise the Risk of Harm to Property, Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and Risk of Harm to Businesses:

- A. SunWater was able to make useful predictions as to the range of weather conditions that might affect Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam by reason of:
  - 1. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 106A-106B;

- 2. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 133 to 142:
- 3. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 158(d)-(f). 163A-163H.

  174(e)-(q). 179A-179I. 192-194. 214-217. 231-234. 248-250.

  270-273. 291-293. 310-315:
- 4. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 200-202: and
- 5. <u>the matters pleaded in paragraphs 151, 158(c), 164-165, 174(d), 180-182, 196-198, 218-219, 235-236, 251-252, 274-275, 294-295, 316-318.</u>
- h) the plaintiff and other Group Members could not direct, control or influence the manner in which SunWater conducted Flood Operations at Somerset Dam or Wivenhoe Dam;
- i) the plaintiff and other Group Members had no ability, 'or alternatively, no practical ability, to protect themselves from the Risk of Harm to Property, the Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment or the Risk of Harm to Businesses:
- j) the plaintiff and other Group Members were dependent upon SunWater taking reasonable care to avoid the Risk of Harm to Property, Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and Risk of Harm to Businesses: and
- k) the plaintiff and other Group Members were accordingly highly vulnerable to harm from the manner in which SunWater exercised its functions in performing Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam.
- a) it-was-reasonably-forosooablo-by-SunWator:
  - that-a-failuro-proporly-to-conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot
     Dam- and Wivonhoo-Dam- may-causo-Groator-Flooding downstroam-of-Wivenhoe-Dam;
  - ii) that-tho-making-of-roloasos-of-wator-from-Wivenhoe-Dam-at volumes-significantly-in-excess-of-those-that-would-have-been nooossary-if-Flood-Oporations-woro-conducted-properly-may causo-Greater-Flooding-downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;

- iii) that-if-Groator-Flooding-woro-causod-by-a-failuro-proporly-to conduct-Flood-Operations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivenhoe

  Dam-that-flooding-may-cause-physical-damage-to-proportios locatod-downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam-than-would-occur-if Flood-Oporations-woro-conducted-properly;
- iv) that tho proportios that would be damaged by such-Greater Flooding-may-include-thoso-locatod-in-tho-areas-located downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;

- A. Segwator, Wivonhoo Dam-Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled Copy, Soptombor 2010.
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections-1-1-3.1-4-8.4.
- C. Further-particulars-may-bo-provided-after-discovery.
  - v) that-if-Groator-Flooding-woro-causod-by-a-failuro-proporly-to conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoe Dam-that-flooding-may-disrupt-tho-commercial-activities-of businossos-oporating-from-ono-or-mere-locations-located downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;
  - vi) that-tho-businossos-so-disrupted-would-include-those businossos-oporating-at-locations-locatod-downstroam-of Wivonhoo-Dam;

## **PARTICULARS**

- A. Sogwator,—*Wivonhoo-Dam-Emorgoncy-Action-Plan*,—Uncontrolled Copy,—Soptombor-<del>2010.</del>
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- C. Further-particulars-may-bo-provided-after-discovery
  - vii) that-Greater Flooding-causod-by-a-failuro-proporly-to-conduct Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-may causo-loss-or-damage-to:

59

- (1) persons-who-hold-an-intorost-in-land-locatod-downstroamof-Wivonhoo-Dam;
- (2) persons-who-ownod-porsonal-proporty-that-was-located downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;-and
- (3) persons-who-regularly-conducted-a-business-or enterprise,-in-whole-or-in-part,-at-ono-or-more-locations located-downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;

including-tho-plaintiff-and-Group-Mombors;

- b) tho-risk-of-harm-of-tho-typos-doscribod-in-subparagraphs-(a)(i)-through-(a)(vii)-was-not-remote-or-insignificant;
- c) tho-plaintiff-and-othor-Group-Mombors-had-no-ability,-or-altornativoly, no-practical-ability,-to-protect-themselves-from-the-harm-doscribod-in subparagraphs-(a)(i)-through-(a)(vii)-in-the-event-that-SunWater-failed properly-to-conduct-Flood-Operations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and Wivenhoo-Dam;
- d) SunWater, as the entity-practically-in-control-of-Flood-Operations at Somorsot-Dam and Wivenhoo Dam, was engaged in an inherently dangerous activity, being the conduct of Flood-Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam;
- e) tho-conduct-of-Flood-Oporations-at-Somerset-Dam-and-Wivonhoo

  Dam-by-SunWator-was-an-extremely-hazardous-activity-which-earried
  with-it-tho-risk-of-harm-to-at-least-244,000-people-locatod-downstroam
  of-Wivenhoe-Dam;-

- A. Sogwator,—*Wivenhoe-Dam-Emergency-Action-Plan*, Uncontrolled Copy,—Soptombor-2010,—p-5.
- f) tho-location-and-idontity-of-porsons-and-businossos-likely-to-be directly-impacted-by-a-failuro-by-SunWator-proporly-to-conduct-Flood Oporations-at-Wivonhoo-Dam-was-reasonably-ascertainable;

- A. Flood-Management-Services Agreement, Service-Schedule, clause-1.
- B. Sogwater, Wivonhoo-Dam-Emergency Action-Plan, Uncontrolled Copy, Soptombor-2010.
- C. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, A, 8.4.
- D. Furthor-particulars-will-bo-provided-by-way-of-correspondence after-discovery.
- g) SunWator had actual knowledge of tho-risk of harm-posed to-persons and-businossos-located-downstroam-of-Wivenhoe-Dam, including porsons-in-tho-position-of tho-plaintiff and other-Group-Mombors, from tho-conduct-of-Flood-Oporations-at-Somersot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo Dam;

- A. Flood-Management-Services-Agreement,-Sorvioo-Schodulo, clause-1.
- B. Sogwator, Wivonhoo-Dam-Emergency Action-Plan, Uncontrolled Copy, Soptombor-2010.
- C. ——Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections-1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- Furthor-particulars-will-bo-provided-by-way-of-correspondence after-discovory.
- h) SunWator-had-tho-practical-ability-to-oxorciso-a-high-dogroo-of-control in-rolation-to-tho-oporation-of-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-so as-to-avoid, or-minimise, the risk that-Flood Oporations-at-Somorsot Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-would-causo-Groator-Flooding-downstroam of-Wivenhoe-Dam;
- i) SunWator had tho moans to make useful predictions as to the range of woathor conditions that might affoot Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam (including predictions as to tho effects of actual and forecast rainfall) and to use those prodictions and the Real Time Flood Model

- to-eperate-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-in-a-mannor-so-as-to minimise-tho-risk-of-Groator-Flooding-downstream-of-Wivenhoe-Dam;
- j) the plaintiff and other Group Members could not direct, control or influence the manner in which SunWater conducted Flood-Operations at Somerset Dam-or Wivenhoe Dam;
- k) tho-plaintiff-and-other-Group-Mombors-woro-dopondont-upon
  -SunWater-taking-reasonable-eare-to-avoid-tho-risk-that-a-failuro-to
  proporly-to-conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and
  Wivenhoo-Dam-would-eause-Groator-Flooding-downstroam-of
  Wivenhoe-Dam;-and
- tho-plaintiff-and-othor-Group-Mombers-wero-accordingly-highly vulnerable-to-harm-from-tho-manner-in-which-SunWator-exercised-its functions-in-performing-Flood-Oporations-at-Somerset-Dam-and Wivonhoo-Dam.
- In light of the facts and matters pleaded in paragraphs <a href="142A-142B">142A-142B</a> and 147, SunWater, in its capacity as the entity having practical control over the operation of Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam, owed a duty to Group Members:
  - a) to take reasonable care in the conduct of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam; and
  - to ensure that reasonable care was taken by persons engaged by or on behalf of SunWater to conduct Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam;

to avoid <u>each of</u> the <u>Risk of Harm to Property. Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment and Risk of Harm to Businesses (SunWater's Duty of Care).</u> risk-that-a-failuro-properly-to-conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-would-causo-Groator-Flooding-downstroam-of Wivonhoe-Dam-(SunWater's-Duty-of-Care)-

## Flood Engineers' Duty of Care

- 149 In December 2010 and January 2011:
  - a) each of the Risk of Harm to Property. Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and Risk of Harm to Businesses was reasonably foreseeable by the Flood Engineers:

## PARTICULARS

- A. <u>Segwater, Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u>
  <u>Copy, September 2010.</u>
- B. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- C. <u>Further particulars may be provided after discovery.</u>
- the Flood Engineers were engaged in an inherently dangerous activity, being the conduct of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam;
- c) the conduct of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe

  Dam by the Flood Engineers was an extremely hazardous activity

  which carried with it the risk of harm to at least 244,000 people

  located downstream of Wivenhoe Dam;

## **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Segwater. Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u> Copy. September 2010, p 5.
- d) the location and identity of persons and businesses likely to be directly impacted by a failure by the Flood Engineers properly to conduct Flood Operations at Wivenhoe Dam was reasonably ascertainable:

- A. <u>Segwater. Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled</u>
  Copy. September 2010.
- B. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.

- C. Further particulars will be provided by way of correspondence after discovery.
- e) the Flood Engineers had actual knowledge of the Risk of Harm to
  Property. Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and Risk of
  Harm to Businesses; particulars
  - A. <u>Segwater. Wivenhoe Dam Emergency Action Plan. Uncontrolled</u> Copy. September 2010.
  - B. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
  - C. <u>Further particulars will be provided by way of correspondence</u> <u>after discovery.</u>
- f) the Flood Engineers were able to exercise a high degree of control in relation to conduct of Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and
  Wivenhoe Dam so as to avoid the Risk of Harm to Property, Risk of
  Interference with Use and Eniovment and Risk of Harm to
  Businesses;
- g) the Flood Engineers had the means to make useful predictions as to the range of weather conditions that might affect Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam (including predictions as to the effects of actual and forecast rainfall), and to use those predictions and the Real Time Flood Model to operate Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam in a manner so as to avoid the Risk of Harm to Property. Risk of Interference with Use and Eniovment and Risk of Harm to Businesses:

- A. The Flood Engineers were able to make useful predictions as to the range of weather conditions that might affect Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam by reason of:
  - 1. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 106A-106B;
  - 2. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 133 to 142;

- 3. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 158(d)-(f), 163A-163H.

  ,174(e)-(0). 179A-179I. 192-194. 214-217. 231-234. 248-250.
  270-273. 291-293. 310-315;
- 4. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 200-202: and
- 5. the matters pleaded in paragraphs 151, 158(c), 164-165, 174(d), 180-182, 196-198, 218-219, 235-236, 251-252, 274-275, 294-295, 316-318.
- the plaintiff and other Group Members could not direct, control or influence the manner in which the Flood Engineers conducted Flood Operations at Somerset Dam or Wivenhoe Dam;
- i) the plaintiff and other Group Members had no ability, or alternatively, no practical ability, to protect themselves from the Risk of Harm to Property, the Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment or the Risk of Harm to Businesses:
- j) the plaintiff and other Group Members were dependent upon the
  Flood Engineers taking reasonable care in the conduct of Flood
  Operations to avoid the Risk of Harm to Property, Risk of Interference
  with Use and Eniovment and Risk of Harm to Businesses; and
- k) the plaintiff and other Group Members were accordingly highly vulnerable to harm from the manner in which the Flood Engineers exercised their functions in performing Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam.
- a) it-was-reasonably foreseeable-by-the-Flood-Engineers:
  - i) that-a-failuro-proporly-to-conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot Dam-and-Wivenhoe-Dam-may-causo-Groator-Flooding downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;
  - ii) that the making of roleases of water from Wivenhoe Dam-at volumes significantly in excess of those that would have been necessary if Flood-Operations were conducted properly may eause Greater Flooding downstream of Wivenhoe Dam;

- iii) that if Greater Flooding woro causod by a failuro proporly to conduct Flood Operations at Somorsot Dam and Wivenhoo Dam, that flooding may causo physical damage to proportios located downstroam of Wivenhoo Dam than would occur if Flood Operations woro conducted proporly;
- iv) that tho -proportios that would -bo -damaged -by -such-Groator Flooding-may-include-thoso-located -downstroam-of-Wivonhoo Dam:

- A. Segwator,—*Wivenhoe-Dam-Emergency-Action-Plan*, Uncontrolled Copy, Soptombor 2010.
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, A, 8.4.
- C. Furthor-particulars-may-bo-provided-after-discovery-
  - that if -Groator -Flooding -woro -causod -by -a-failuro-proporly -to conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somerset -Dam-and-Wivonhoo Dam-that-flooding-may-disrupt-the -commercial-activities-of businossos-oporating-from-one-or-more-locations-locatod downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;
  - vi) that tho businossos so disrupted would include those businesses oporating at locations within tho areas located downstroam of Wivonhoo Dam;

- A. Sogwator, *Wivonhoo-Dam-Emergency Action Plan*, Uncontrolled Copy, Soptombor 2010.
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sootions 1.1, 3.1, A, 8.4.
- C. Furthor-particulars-may-bo-provided-aftor-discovery.
  - vii) that Greater Flooding caused by a failuro proporly to conduct Flood-Operations at Somorsot Dam and Wivonhoo Dam may causo loss or damage to:

- (1) persons-who-hold-an-interest-in-land-located-downstroamof-Wivonhoo-Dam;
- (2) persons-who-ownod-porsonal-proporty-that-was-located downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;-and
- (3) persons-who-regularly-oonduotod-a-business-or enterprise,-in-whole-or-in-part,-at-one-or-more-locations locatod-downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam;

including-tho-plaintiff-and-Group-Members;

- b) the-risk-of-harm-of-tho-typos-doscribod-in-subparagraphs-(a)(i) through-(a)(vii)-was-not-remote-or-insignificant;
- c) the-plaintiff and-Group Mombors had no ability, or alternatively, no practical ability, to-protect thomsolvos from the harm-doscribed in subparagraphs (a)(i)-through (a)(vii) in the event that the Flood Engineers failed properly to conduct Flood Operations at Somersot Dam-and Wivenhoe Dam;
- d) tho-Flood-Enginoors-woro-engaged-in-an-inherently-dangerous activity, being-tho-conduct-of-Flood-Operations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and Wivenhoe-Dam;
- e) the-conduct-of-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivenhoe
  -Dam-by-tho-Flood-Enginoors,-was-an-extremely-hazardous-activity
  which-earried-with-it-tho-risk-of-harm-to-at-least 244,000-people
  located-downstream-of-Wivenhoe-Dam;

- A. Sogwater,—*Wivonhoo-Dam-Emergency-Action-Plan*, Uncontrolled Copy,—Soptombor-2010,—p-5.
- f) tho-Flood-Enginoors-had-actual-knowlodgo-of-tho-risk-of-harm-posod to-porsons-and-businossos-locatod-downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam; including-porsons-in-tho-position-of-the-plaintiff-and-Group-Mombors; from-tho-conduct-of-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and Wivonhoo-Dam:

- A. Sogwator, *Wivonhoo-Dam-Emorgoncy-Action-Plan*, Uncontrolled Copy, Soptombor-2010.
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sootions 1.1, 3.1, 4, 8.4.
- C. Furthor particulars will bo provided by way of correspondence after discovery.
- g) tho-location-and-identity-of-porsons-and-businossos-likely-to-bo directly-impacted-by-a-failure-by-the-Flood-Engineers-properly-to conduct-Flood-Operations-at-Wivenhoo-Dam-was-reasonably ascertainable;

- A. Segwator, Wivonhoo-Dam-Emergency Action Plan, Uncontrolled Copy, Soptombor 2010.
- B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sootions-1,-1,-3,-1,-4,-8,-4,-
- C. Furthor-particulars-will-bo-provided-by-way-of-corrospondonco aftor-discovory-
- h) tho-Flood-Engineers-woro-practically-able-to-oxorciso-a-high-dogroo of-control-in-relation-to-conduct-of-Flood-Operations-at-Somorsot-Dam and-Wivonhoo-Dam-so-as-to-avoid-tho-risk-that-Flood-Operations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoe-Dam-would-causo-Groator-Flooding downstream-of-Wivenhoe-Dam;
- i) the -Flood-Enginoors -had -tho-moans -to-make-useful-predictions-as-to tho-range-of-woathor-conditions-that-might-affoct-Somorsot-Dam-and Wivonhoo-Dam-(including-predictions-as-to-tho-effects-of-actual-and forecast-rainfall), and to-use thoso-predictions and tho-Real-Time -Flood-Model-to-operate-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-in-a -mannor-so-as-to-minimise, tho-risk-that-thoso, woathor-conditions would-causo-Greater\_Flooding\_downstream\_of\_Wivenhoe\_Dam;
- j) the plaintiff and other Group Members could not direct, control or influence the manner in which the Flood-Engineers conducted Flood Operations at Somersot Dam-or Wivenhoe Dam;

- k) tho-plaintiff-and-othor-Group-Mombors-woro-dopondent-upon-the
  Flood-Enginoors-taking-reasonablo-care-in-tho-conduct-of-Flood
  Oporations-to-avoid-tho-risk-that-a-failure-by-tho-Flood-Enginoors
  proporly-to-conduct-Flood-Operations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and
  Wivonhoo-Dam-would-cause-flooding-downstream-of-Wivenhoe-Dam;
- tho-plaintiff-and-othor-Group-Mombors-woro-accordingly-highly vulnorablo-to-harm-from-tho-mannor-in-which-tho-Flood-Enginoers exercised their-functions-in-performing-Flood-Oporations-at-Somersot Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam.
- 150 In light of the facts and matters pleaded in paragraphs <a href="142A-142B">142A-142B</a> and 149, each of the Flood Engineers owed a duty to Group Members to take reasonable care in the operation of Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam to avoid <a href="each of">each of</a> the Risk of Harm to Property, Risk of Interference with Use and Enjoyment and Risk of Harm to Businesses. risk-that-a-failuro-proporly to-conduct-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot Dam-and-Wivenhoe-Dam-would cause-Groator-Flooding-downstroam-of-Wivonhoo-Dam-

# M <u>Events of 1 December to 16 December 2010 December-2010-Flood</u> Operations

# **Rainfall and Inflows**

151 Between 1 December and 15 December 2010, the catchment areas for Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe experienced rainfall of between approximately 52 mm and 270 mm.

#### **PARTICULARS**

A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe

Dam - October to December 2010, May 2011, pp 47-48.

# *'Water Level*

- 152 In the period 1 December 2010 to 13 December 2010:
  - a) the water level in Lake Wivenhoe rose from approximately
     EL 67.00 m AHD to approximately 67.33 m AHD; and

the water level in Lake Somerset rose from approximately EL 99.06 m
 AHD to approximately EL 99.68 m AHD.

#### **PARTICULARS**

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, pp 18 & 49-50.
- B. Lake Wivenhoe water level at 6.30am on 1 December 2010 EL67.01 m AHD

Lake Wivenhoe water level at 6.30am on 13 December 2010 - EL 67.30 m AHD

Segwater, Spreadsheet containing Lake Wivenhoe water levels between 1 December 2010 and 31 January 2011, Doc identification number: MAU.500.020.0027.

C. Lake Somerset water level at 6.30am on 1 December 2010 - EL 99.06 m AHD

Email from damlevels@segwater.com.au to DG-Ops Dam Levels, DG-Ops duty engineers, DG-ops Dam Levels Central, sent Wednesday 1 December 2010 at 6.27am; Subject: FW: Somerset Dam.

# Flood Operations

153 At around 7 am on 11 December 2010, Segwater and SunWater mobilised the Flood Operations Centre.

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, p 8.
- 154 The Flood Engineers worked the following shifts in the period 13 December to 16 December 2010:



*		
Monday 13/12/10 07:00	Monday 13/12/10 19:00	Mr Malone
Monday 13/12/10 19:00	Tuesday 14/12/10 7:00	Mr Tibaldi
Tuesday 14/12/10 07:00	Tuesday 14/12/10 19:00	Mr Malone
Tuesday 14/12/10 19:00	Wednesday 15/12/10 07:00	Mr Tibaldi
Wednesday 15/12/10 07:00	Wednesday 15/12/10 19:00	Mr Ruffini
Wednesday 15/12/10 19:00	Thursday 16/12/10 07:00	Mr Tibaldi
Thursday 16/12/10 07:00	Thursday 16/12/10 10:30	Mr Malone

155 At or around 3:00 pm on 13 December 2010, the Flood Engineers commenced releasing water from Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam consistent with Strategy W1 at Wivenhoe Dam and Strategy S2 at Somerset Dam.

# **PARTICULARS**

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, pp 48-49.
- 156 The Flood Engineers discontinued the releases and Flood Operations <u>at or around 10:00 am</u> on 16 December 2010.

# **PARTICULARS**

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, pp 11 & 47.
- 157 The Flood Engineers demobilised the Flood Operations Centre at or around 10:30 am on 16 December 2010.

## **PARTICULARS**

A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam - October to December 2010, May 2011, p 11.

- 158 At or around the time at which the <del>flood</del> releases and Flood Operations were discontinued:
  - a) Lake Wivenhoe remained above Full Supply Level at approximately EL 67.10 m AHD:
  - b) Lake Somerset remained above Full Supply Level at approximately EL 99.07 m AHD;
  - flood inflows into both Lake Wivenhoe and Lake Somerset were continuing;
  - the Bureau of Meteorology 1-day rainfall forecast for 16 December 2010 predicted continuing rain in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas;
  - e) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 16 December to 19
    December 2010 predicted 50 15 to 100 50 mm of rainfall in the
    Brisbane River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake
    Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
  - f) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 16 December to 23 December 2010 predicted 50 to 100 mm of rainfall in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
  - g) <u>a Flood Event (as defined in paragraph 102 above) was occurring.</u>

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, pp 49-50.
  - B. Lake Wivenhoe water level at 10.00am on 16 December 2010 -EL 67.10 m AHD
    - Segwater, Spreadsheet containing Lake Wivenhoe water levels between 1 December 2010 and 31 January 2011, Doc identification number: MAU.500.020.0027.
  - C. Lake Somerset water level on 16 December 2010 EL 99.07 mAHD

- Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, p 18.
- D. Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast issued-15

  December 2010 for period 16 December 2010.
- E. Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast issued-15

  Dooombor-2010 for period 16 December to 19 December 2010.
- F. Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast issued-15

  December 2010 for period 16 December to 23 December 2010.

#### 16 December Breaches

- 158A In the circumstances pleaded in paragraphs 151-152 and 158, the cessation of releases and Flood Operations on 16 December 2010 created a significant risk:
  - a) that there would be insufficient flood storage capacity in Lake

    Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe to store flood inflows should further
    rainfall occur in accordance with, or in excess of, that forecast by the
    Bureau of Meteorology: and
  - that, without such capacity, subsequent releases would be necessary
     in volumes that would cause urban flooding downstream of Wivenhoe <a href="Dam">Dam</a>.
- 159 [Not used] At-tho-time-flood-roloasos-from-Wivonhoe-Dam-were discontinued on-16 Dooombor-2010, a-reasonably prudont-flood-engineer responsible-for-Flood-Oporations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam:
  - a) would-havo-had-regard-to-tho-flood-mitigation-<del>objectives</del>-in-tho-Flood Mitigation-Manual-and-the-priority-between-them;
  - b) would-havo-eonsidered-tho-likely-effect-of-continuing-inflows-in determining-whether-to-cease-flood-releases-and-Flood-Operations;
  - would-havo-considered-tho-likely-effect-of-continuing-rainfall-in determining-whether-to-cease-flood-releases-and-Flood-Operations;

- d) would-havo-considered-forecast-rainfall-in-determining-whothor-to cease-flood-releases-and-Flood-Operations;
- e) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-risk-that-futuro-rainfall-may-exceed-that predicted-by-the-Bureau-of-Meteorology;
- f) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-risk-that-further-rainfall-might-gonorato substantial-runoff-given-previous-rainfall;
- g) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-risk-that-a-failuro-to-continue-Flood
  Oporations-and-flood-releases-might-result-in-thoro-boing-insufficient
  available-capacity-in-tho-flood-storage-compartments-of-Somorsot
  -Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-to-provont-largo-scale-roloasos-in-case-of
  further-rain;
- h) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-current-wator-lovols-of-Lako-Somorsot and-Lake-Wivenhoe;
- i) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-magnitude-of-forecast-rainfall-and-tho likoly-impact-such-rainfall-would-havo-on-dam-wator-lovols-should-it eventuate;-and
- j) would-have-oonsidorod-whothor-wator-levels-should-bo-reduced below-Full-Supply-Level-given-past-rainfall,-ongoing-inflows-and-the likelihood-of-rainfall-in-the-near-futuro
- 160 Further, by reason of the matters pleaded at <u>paragraphs 158-158A</u> paragraphs <u>158-159</u>, a reasonably prudent flood engineer responsible for Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam on 16 December 2010:
  - a) would have complied with the Flood Mitigation Manual:
  - b) would have continued Flood Operations and releases throughout 16

    December 2010;
  - c) would have implemented Strategy W1 at Wivenhoe Dam;
  - d) would have implemented Strategy S2 at Somerset Dam;

- e) would have caused Wivenhoe Dam and Somerset Dam to release water at rates approximating the rate of inflow:
- f) would have reduced the water level in Lake Somerset to no higher than approximately EL 99.04 m AHD by the end of 16 December 2010;
- g) would have reduced the water level in Lake Wivenhoe to no higher than approximately EL 67.09 m AHD by the end of 16 December 2010:
- h) would have continued Flood Operations until Lake Somerset and
  Lake Wivenhoe were no longer likely to exceed their respective Full
  Supply Levels.

- A. <u>A reasonably prudent flood engineer would have complied with the Flood Mitigation Manual by taking the actions pleaded in paragraphs 160(b)-(h) below.</u>
- B. Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1, 3.1, 8.4, 8.5, 9.3, 9.4.
- C. <u>Dr Ronald K Christensen</u>, *Wivenhoe and Somerset Dam*<u>Operations During the Brisbane River Flood of December 2010</u>

  <u>and January 2011</u>, 19 February 2015 (Christensen Report),

  <u>Chapter VIII. [4841-[515].</u>
- a) would-have-reasonably-construed-the-Flood-Mitigation-Manual;

- A. A-reasonably-prudont-flood-enginoor-would-havo-construed-tho
  -Flood-Mitigation-Manual-to-roguiro-tho-Flood-Enginoors-to-use
  the-woathor-forooast-information-supplied-by-tho-Bureau-of
  -Meteorology-in-dotormining-roloaso-strategies-for-Somorsot-Dam
  and-Wivonhoo-Dam.
- B. A-reasonably-prudont-flood-enginoor-would-havo-construed-the -Flood-Mitigation-Manual-to-roguire-the-actions-pleaded-in paragraphs-160(b)-(d)-and-(g)-(j)-below-

b) would-havo-<del>complied</del>-with-tho-roguiromonts-of-tho-Flood-Mitigation
-Manual:

#### **PARTICULARS**

- A. A-reasonably-prudont-flood-engineer-would-havo-oompliod-with tho-Flood-Mitigation-Manual-by-taking-tho-actions-ploadod-in paragraphs-160(c)-(j)-paragraphs-160(o)-(d)-and-(g)-(j)-below-
- c) would-have-implemented-Strategy-W1-at-Wivenhoe-Dam;
- d) would-havo-mado-roasonablo-prodictions,-and-formed-reasonable expectations,-with-respect-to-thoso-matters-in-relation-to-which-the Flood-Mitigation-Manual-reguirod-tho-Flood-Enginoors-to-make predictions-and-form-expectations,-and-would-havo-acted-in accordance-with-thoso-prodictions-and-oxpootations-in-complying-with the-requirements-of-the-Flood-Mitigation-Manual;
- e) would-havo-adhorod-to-tho-dictates-of-tho-Flood-Mitigation-Manual-in determining-whether-to-continue-Flood-Operations-and-releases;
- f) would-havo-expected-that-tho-wator-lovols-in-Lako-Somerset-and

  Lake-Wivonhoo-would-continue-to-exceed-their-respective-Full-Supply

  Levels-such-that-a-Flood-Event-was-occurring;
- g) would-havo-considered-that,-according-to-the-terms-of-tho-Flood Mitigation-Manual,-a-Flood-Event-had-boon-ongoing-since-on-or around-2-December-2010:
- h) would havo-continued Flood-Oporations and flood-roloasos at Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-on-16-Dooombor:
- i) would havo-continued Flood-Oporations-until-Lako-Somorsot-and Lako-Wivonhoo-woro-no-longor-likoly-to-exceed-thoir-respective-Full Supply-Lovols-

## **PARTICULARS**

B. Flood-Mitigation-Manual,-sections 1-1,-3+1,-8-4,-8-5,-9-4.

- 161 In the circumstances pleaded at paragraphs 156-160, the Flood Engineers (or one or more of them) failed to do one or more of the things pleaded in paragraph 160. →
  - a) failed-to-havo-regard-to-or-to-accord-sufficient-weight-to-or-more of-tho-matters-pleaded-in-paragraph-159; and
  - b) <u>failod-to-do-ono-or-moro-of-tho-things-ploadod-in-paragraph-160</u>.
- By reason of the matters pleaded in the preceding paragraph, the Flood Engineers, or one or more of them, breached their duty of care to the plaintiff and other Group Members on 16 December 2010 (the 16 December Breaches).
- 163 Immediately upon the cessation of Flood Operations on 16 December2010, the water levels in Lake Wivenhoe and Lake Somerset began to rise.

# N Events of 16 17 December to 24 December 2010

#### Weather Forecasts

## <u>163A On 17 December 2010:</u>

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 17 December to 20

  December 2010 predicted 25-100 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 17 December to 24

  December 2010 predicted 50-100 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>, 17 December to 20 December 2010.
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
   17 December to 24 December 2010.

#### 163B On 18 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 18 December to 21

  December 2010 predicted 50-100 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 18 December to 25

  December 2010 predicted 100-150 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane
  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

# **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>

  18 December to 21 December 2010.
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period 18 December to 25 December 2010.</u>

# 163C On 19 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 19 December to 22

  December 2010 predicted 50-100 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 19 December to 26

  December 2010 predicted 75-150 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

# <u>PARTICULARS</u>

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>

  19 <u>December to 22 December 2010.</u>
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u> 19 December to 26 December 2010.

# 163D On 20 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 20 December to 23

  December 2010 predicted 25-50 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 20 December to 27

  December 2010 predicted 40-100 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

## **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period 20 December to 23 December 2010.</u>
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>20 December to 27 December 2010.

## 163E On 21 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 21 December to 24

  December 2010 predicted 25-75 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment

  areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 21 December to 28

  December 2010 predicted 100-200 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane
  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
   21 <u>December to 24 December 2010.</u>
- B. Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period21 December to 28 December 2010.

## 163F On 22 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 22 December to 25

  December 2010 predicted 50-125 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 22 December to 29

  December 2010 predicted 100-200 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane

  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

## **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>22 December to 25 December 2010.
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>

  22 <u>December to 29 December 2010.</u>

## 163G On 23 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 23 December to 26

  December 2010 predicted 50-100 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 23 December to 30

  December 2010 predicted 125-200 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane

  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
  23 <u>December to 26 December 2010.</u>
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology</u>, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period23 December to 30 December 2010.

## 163H On 24 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 24 December to 27

  December 2010 predicted 100-150 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane

  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 24 December to 31

  December 2010 predicted 150-200 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane
  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

# **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period 24 December to 27 December 2010.</u>
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
   24 December to 31 December 2010.

## Rainfall and Inflows

164 There were further rainfalls over the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas in the period 46 17 December to 24 December 2010.

## **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Segwater. Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe</u>

  <u>Dam October to December 2010. May 2011. PP 55-64.</u>
- 165 Total rainfall during this period averaged approximately 115 mm in the Stanley River upstream of Somerset Dam and 71 mm in the rest of the Brisbane River Basin upstream of Wivenhoe Dam.

#### **PARTICULARS**

A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe

Dam - October to December 2010, May 2011, pp 63-64.

## Water Level

166 In the period 17 46 December to 21 December 2010:

- a) the water level in Lake Wivenhoe rose from approximately EL 67.10 m AHD to approximately EL 68.24 m AHD; and
- b) the water level in Lake Somerset rose from approximately EL 99.10 m AHD to approximately EL 100.42 m AHD.

A. Lake Wivenhoe water level at 9.00am on 16 December 2010 - EL 67.10 m AHD

Lake Wivenhoe water level at 4.00am on 21 December 2010 - EL 68.24 m AHD

Segwater, Spreadsheet containing Lake Wivenhoe water levels between 1 December 2010 and 31 January 2011, Doc identification number: MAU.500.020.0027.

B. Lake Somerset water level on 16 December 2010 - EL 99.07 m

AHD

Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam - October to December 2010, May 2011, p 18.

C. Lake Somerset water level on 20 December 2010 - EL 100.42 m AHD

Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam - October to December 2010, May 2011, p 74.

# Flood Operations

167 Segwater and SunWater mobilised the Flood Operations Centre at or around 10:00 am on 17 December 2010.

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, p 8.
- 168 The Flood Engineers worked the following shifts in the period 17 December to 24 December 2010:

Friday 17/12/10 16:00	Saturday 18/12/10 07:00	Mr Ruffini
Saturday 18/12/10 07:00	Saturday 18/12/10 19:00	Mr Tibaldi
Saturday 18/12/10 19:00	Sunday 19/12/10 07:00	Mr Malone
Sunday 19/12/10 07:00	Sunday 19/12/10 19:00	Mr Ayre
Sunday 19/12/10 19:00	Monday 20/12/10 07:00	Mr Tibaldi
Monday 20/12/10 07:00	Monday 20/12/10 19:00	Mr Ruffini
Monday 20/12/10 19:00	Tuesday 21/12/10 07:00	Mr Ayre
Tuesday 21/12/10 07:00	Tuesday 21/12/10 19:00	Mr Malone
Tuesday 21/12/10 19:00	Wednesday 22/12/10 07:00	Mr Ruffini
Wednesday 22/12/10 07:00	Wednesday 22/12/10 19:00	Mr Malone
Wednesday 22/12/10 19:00	Thursday 23/12/10 07:00	Mr Tibaldi
Thursday 23/12/10 07:00	Thursday 23/12/10 19:00	Mr Ayre
Thursday 23/12/10 19:00	Friday 24/12/10 07:00	Mr Tibaldi
Friday 24/12/10 07:00	Friday 24/12/10 15:00	Mr Ruffini

169 At or around 6:00 pm on 17 December 2010, the Flood Engineers, or one or more of them, commenced releasing water from Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam at flow rates consistent with Strategy W1 at Wivenhoe Dam and Strategy S2 at Somerset Dam.

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, p 119 450.
- 170 On or around 24 December 2010, the Chief Executive Officer of the SEQ Water Grid Manager informed Segwater that Segwater was authorised to draw down Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe to 95% of their combined Full Supply Level (Temporary Full Supply Level).

- A. Letter from Barry Dennien, Chief Executive Officer, SEQ Water
   Grid Manager, to Peter Burrows, Chief Executive Officer,
   Segwater, dated 24 December 2010.
- 170A The Temporary Full Supply Level:
  - a) for Somerset Dam was EL 98.54 m AHD: and
  - b) for Wivenhoe Dam was EL 66.45 m AHD.
- 171 Notwithstanding the authorisation pleaded in paragraph 170, Segwater did not take steps to draw down Lake Somerset or Lake Wivenhoe to 95% of their combined Full Supply Level on 24 December 2010 or at any material time thereafter.
- 172 The Flood Engineers discontinued the releases and Flood Operations <u>by</u> 1:00 pm on 24 December 2010.

### **PARTICULARS**

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, pp 12 & 50.
- 173 The Flood Engineers demobilised the Flood Operations Centre at or around 3:00 pm on 24 December 2010.

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, p 12.
- 174 At or around the time at which the fleed releases were discontinued on 24 December 2010:
  - a) Lake Wivenhoe remained above <u>Temporary Full Supply Level and</u>
     Full Supply Level at approximately EL 67.10 m AHD;
  - b) Lake Somerset remained above <u>Temporary Full Supply Level and</u>
     Full Supply Level at approximately EL 99.10 m AHD;

- flood inflows into both Lake Wivenhoe and Lake Somerset were continuing;
- d) rain was continuing to fall in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas;
- e) the Bureau of Meteorology 1 -day rainfall forecast for 24 December 2010 was for continuing rain in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas;
- f) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 24 December to 27 December 2010 predicted 50 100 to 150 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- g) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 24 December to 31 December 2010 predicted 150 to 200 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- h) a Flood Event (as defined in paragraph 102 above) was occurring.

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, pp 74-75.
- B. Lake Wivenhoe water level at 10.00am on 24 December 2010 -EL 67.10 m AHD
  - Segwater, Spreadsheet containing Lake Wivenhoe water levels between 1 December 2010 and 31 January 2011, Doc identification number: MAU.500.020.0027.
- C. Lake Somerset water level on 24 December 2010 EL 99.10 m

  AHD
  - Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, p 18.
- D. Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast issued 23
   Dooombor-2010 for period 24 December 2010.

- E. Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast is **cured 33**Dooombor 2010 for period 24 December to 27 December 2010.
- F. Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast issued-23 Dooombor 2010 for period 24 December to 31 December 2010...

# 17-24 December Breaches

- 174A In the circumstances pleaded in paragraphs 163A-166 and 174. the cessation of Flood Operations and releases on 24 December 2010 created a significant risk:
  - a) that there would be insufficient flood storage capacity in Lake

    Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe to store flood inflows should further
    rainfall occur in accordance with, or in excess of that forecast by the
    Bureau of Meteorology; and
  - b) that, without such capacity, subsequent releases would be necessary in volumes that would cause urban flooding downstream of Wivenhoe Dam.
- 175 [Not used] At the time-flood-roloasos-from-Wivenhoo-Dam-wore discontinued-on-24-December 2010,-a-reasonably-prudont-flood-onginoor rosponsiblo-for-Flood-Operations-at-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoe-Dam:
  - a) would-havo-had-regard-to-tho-flood-mitigation-objectives-in-the-Flood Mitigation-Manual-and-the-priority-between-them;
  - b) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-likoly-effect-of-continuing-inflows-in determining-whether-to-cease-flood-releases-and-Flood-Operations;
  - c) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-likoly-offeot-of-continuing-rainfall-in determining-whether-to-cease-flood-releases-and-Flood-Operations;
  - d) would-havo-considered-forooast-rainfall-in-dotormining-whothor-to cease-flood-releases-and-Flood-Operations;-
  - e) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-risk-that-furthor-rainfall-might-generate substantial-runoff-given-previous-rainfall;

- f) would-havo-considered-the-risk-that-a-failuro-to-continue-Flood Operations-and-flood-releasos-might-rosult-in-thoro-boing-insufficient available-capacity-in-tho-flood-storage-compartments-of-Somerset Dam-and-Wivonhoe-Dam-to-prevent-largo-scale-roloasos-in-case-of further-rain:
- g) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-risk-that-futuro-rainfall-may-oxcood-that predicted-by-the-Bureau-of-Meteorology;
- h) would-havo-oonsidorod-tho-current-wator-lovols-of-Lako-Somorsot and-Lake-Wivenhoe;
- i) would-havo-considered-tho-magnitude-of-forooast-rainfall-and-tho likoly-impact-such-rainfall-would-havo-on-dam-wator-lovols-should-it eventuate;-and
- j) would-havo-oonsidorod-whothor-wator-levels-should-bo-reduced below-Full-Supply-Level-given-past-rainfall-ongoing-inflows-and-tho-likelihood-of-rainfall-in-tho-noar-future.
- 176 Further, by reason of the matters pleaded at <u>paragraphs 174-174A</u>
  paragraphs-174-175, a reasonably prudent flood engineer responsible for
  Flood Operations at Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam en in the period 17
  to 24 December 2010:
  - a) would have complied with the Flood Mitigation Manual;
  - b) would have continued Flood Operations and releases at Somerset

    Dam and Wivenhoe Dam on 24 December;
  - c) would have implemented and maintained Strategy W3 at Wivenhoe

    Dam for substantially all of the period 18 to 24 December 2010;
  - d) would have implemented and maintained Strategy S2 at Somerset

    Dam throughout the period 17 to 24 December 2010;
  - e) would have caused Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam to release water at rates substantially exceeding the rate of inflow;

- f) would have reduced the water level in Lake Somerset to no higher than:
  - i) approximately EL 95.75 m AHD by the end of 24 December 2010; or. alternatively.
  - ii) Temporary Full Supply Level by the end of 24 December 2010;
     or. alternatively.
  - H) Full Supply Level by the end of 24 December 2010;
- g) would have reduced the water level in Lake Wivenhoe to no higher than:
  - i) approximately EL 63.93 m AHD by the end of 24 December 2010; or, alternatively,
  - ii) <u>Temporary Full Supply Level by the end of 24 December 2010;</u>
     <u>or, alternatively.</u>
  - iii) Full Supply Level by the end of 24 December 2010; and
- h) would have continued Flood Operations until Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe were no longer likely to exceed their respective Temporary Full Supply Levels, or alternatively, their Full Supply Levels.

- A. <u>A reasonably prudent flood engineer would have complied with</u>
  the Flood Mitigation Manual by taking the actions pleaded in paragraphs 176(b)-(h).
- B. <u>Flood Mitigation Manual, sections 1.1.3.1. 8.4, 8.5, 9.3, 9.4.</u>
- C. Christensen Report, Chapter VIII. [516]-[644].
- a) would have reasonably construed the Flood Mitigation Manual;

### **PARTICULARS**

A. A-reasonably-prudont-flood-onginoor-would-havo-construed-tho
-Flood-Mitigation-Manual-to-roguiro-tho-Flood-Enginoors-to-use
tho-woathor-forecast-information-supplied-by-tho-Bureau-of

- Motoorology-in-dotormining-roloaso-strategies-for-Somorsot-Dam and-Wivenhoe-Dam.
- B. A-reasonably-prudont-flood-onginoor-would-havo-construed-tho Flood-Mitigation-Manual-to-roguiro-tho-actions-pleaded-in paragraphs-176(b)-(d)-and-(g)-(j)-below-
- b) would-havo-complied-with-the-requirements-of-tho-Flood-Mitigation -Manual:

- A. A-roasonably-prudont-flood-onginoor-would-have-complied-with tho-Flood-Mitigation-Manual-by-taking-the-actions-pleadod-in paragraphs-176(c)-(d)-and-176(g)-(j)-below.
- c) would-havo-mado-roasonablo-predictions,—and-formed-roasonablo oxpootations,—with-respect-to-thoso-matters-in-relation-to-which-tho ·Flood-Mitigation-Manual-required tho-Flood-Enginoors-to-make prodictions-and-form-oxpootations,—and-would-havo-acted-in accordance-with-those-predictions-and-oxpootations-in-complying-with the-requirements-of-the-Flood-Mitigation-Manual;
- d) would-havo-adhorod-to-tho-dictates-of-tho-Flood-Mitigation-Manual-in determining-whether-to-continue-Flood-Operations-and-releases;
- e) would-havo-expected that-tho-water-lovols-in-Lako-Somorsot-and
  Lako-Wivonhoo-would-continue-to-oxcood-their-respective-Full-Supply
  Levels-such-that-a-Flood-Event-was-occurring;
- f) would-havo-considered-that,-according-to-tho-terms-of-tho-Flood ·Mitigation-Manual,-a-Flood-Event-had-boon-ongoing-since-on-or around-2-December-2010;
- g) would-havo-<del>continued</del>-Flood-Oporations-and-flood-releases-at Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-on-16-December;
- h) would-havo-causod-Somorsot-Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-to-roloaso wator-at-ratos-substantially-exceeding-the-rate-of-inflow;

- i) would-have-mado-sufficient-procautionary-roloasos-from-Somerset

  -Dam-and-Wivonhoo-Dam-to-onsuro-that-thoro-was-sufficient-available
  capacity-in-tho-flood-storage-compartments-of-Somorsot-Dam-and
  Wivonhoe-Dam-to-avoid-or-minimise-tho-risk-that-largo-scale-releases
  would-bo-roguirod-should-furthor-rainfall-occur-in-accordance-with,-or
  -in-excess-of-that-forooast-by-tho-Bureau-of-Meteorology;
- j) would havo continued Flood-Oporations until-Lako-Somorsot and Lako-Wivonhoo-woro-no-longor-likoly-to-exceed-thoir-respective-Full Supply-Lovols;-would-havo-continued-to-draw-down-Lako-Somorsot and-Lako-Wivonhoo-to-95%-of-thoir-combined-Full-Supply-Lovols-aftor tho-Flood-Evont-had-concluded, as-permitted-by-tho-authorisation ploadod-in-paragraph-170.

- A. Flood-Mitigation-Manual, sections 1-1, 3-1, 8.4, 8.5, 9.4.
- 177 In the circumstances pleaded at paragraphs <u>,167-176</u>, the Flood Engineers (or one or more of them) <u>failed to do one or more of the things pleaded in paragraph 176.÷</u>
  - a) failod-to-havo-regard-to-or-to-accord-sufficient-weight-to-one-or-more of-the-matters-ploaded-in-paragraph-175; and
  - b) failod-to-do-ono-or-moro-of-tho-things-ploadod-in-paragraph-176.
- By reason of the matters pleaded in the preceding paragraph, the Flood Engineers, or one or more of them, breached their duty of care to the plaintiff and other Group Members eft in the period 17-24 December 2010 (the 17-24 December Breaches).
- 179 Immediately upon the Flood Engineers, or one or more of them, ceasing Flood Operations on 24 December 2010, the water levels in Lake Wivenhoe and Lake Somerset began to rise.

# O Events of 24 25 December 2010 to 1 January 2011

### Weather Forecasts

### 179A On 24 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 24 December to 27

  December 2010 predicted 100-150 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane

  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 24 December to 31

  December 2010 predicted 150-200 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane
  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

### **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>24 December to 27 December 2010.
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period 24 December to 31 December 2010.</u>

### 179B On 25 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 25 December to 28

  December 2010 predicted 150-250 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane
  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 25 December 2010 to 1.

  January 2011 predicted 200-300 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

## **PARTICULARS**

A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>

25 <u>December to 28 December 2010,</u>

B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
 25 December 2010 to 1 January 2011.

### 179C On 26 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 26 December to 29

  December 2010 predicted 100-200 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane
  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 26 December 2010 to 2

  January 2011 predicted 200-300 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

### <u>PARTICULARS</u>

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology</u>, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period
   26 December to 29 December 2010.
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
  26 December 2010 to 2 January 2011,

### 179D On 27 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 27 December to 30

  December 2010 predicted 100-150 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane

  River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 27 December 2010 to 3

  January 2011 predicted 100-200 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology</u>, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period
   <u>27 December to 30 December 2010.</u>
- B. Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period
   27 December 2010 to 3 January 2011.

### 179E On 28 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 28 December to 31

  December 2010 predicted 25-50 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 28 December 2010 to 4

  January 2011 predicted 25-50 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

### **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
  28 December 2010 to 31 December 2010.
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>28 December 2010 to 4 January 2011.

### 179F On 29 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 29 December 2010 to 1

  January 2011 predicted 5-25 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 29 December 2010 to 5

  January 2011 predicted 25-50 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

### **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
  29 <u>December 2010 to 1 January 2011.</u>
- B. Bureau of Meteorology. Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period 29 December 2010 to 5 January 2011.

### 179G On 30 December 2010:

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 30 December 2010 to 2

  January 2011 predicted 1-10 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin. including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 30 December 2010 to 6

  January 2011 predicted 10-15 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u> 30 December 2010 to 2 January 2011.
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
  30 <u>December 2010 to 6 January 2011.</u>

## <u>179H On 31 December 2010:</u>

- a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 31 December 2010 to 2

  January 2011 predicted 10-15 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- b) the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 31 December 2010 to 7

  January 2011 predicted 10-15 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River

  Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

## **PARTICULARS**

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
  31 <u>December 2010 to 2 January 2011.</u>
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>31 December 2010 to 7 January 2011.

## 179I On 1 January 2011:

a) the Bureau of Meteorology 4-day forecast for 1 January to 4 January 2011 predicted 10-25 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River Basin.

- including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas; and
- the Bureau of Meteorology 8-day forecast for 1 January to 8 January
   2011 predicted 15-25 mm of rainfall in the Brisbane River Basin, including in the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas.

- A. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>
  <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/j.june.2011.1007">1 January to 4 January 2011</a>.
- B. <u>Bureau of Meteorology, Poor Man's Ensemble forecast for period</u>

  1 January to 8 January 2011.

#### Rainfall and Inflows

180 There were further rainfalls over the Lake Somerset and Lake Wivenhoe catchment areas in the period 24 <u>25</u> December to 31 December 2010.

### **PARTICULARS**

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, p 92.
- In the five-day period from 25 December to 29 December 2010, there was average rainfall of approximately 107 mm over the Lake Somerset catchment and 80 mm average rainfall over the Lake Wivenhoe catchment.

#### **PARTICULARS**

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam --October to December 2010, May 2011, p 92.
- 182 From 24 <u>25</u> December 2010 to 2 January 2011, total rainfall averaged 126 mm over the Lake Somerset catchment and 80 mm over the Lake Wivenhoe catchment.

#### **PARTICULARS**

A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam - October to December 2010, May 2011, p 92.

### Water Level

In the period 24 <u>25 December 2010</u> to 29 December 2010, the water level in Lake Somerset rose from approximately EL 99.10 m AHD to <u>approximately EL 99.98 m AHD.</u>

#### **PARTICULARS**

A. Lake Somerset water level on 24 December 2010 - EL 99.10 m AHD

Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam - October to December 2010, May 2011, p 18.

B. Lake Somerset water level at 9.20am on 28 December 2010 EL 100.00 m AHD

Email from damlevels@seqwater.com.au to DG-Ops Dam Levels, DG-Ops duty engineers, DG-ops Dam Levels Central, sent Tuesday, 28 December 2010 at 9.18am; Subject: FW: Somerset Dam.

In the period 24 25 December 2010 to 31 December 2010, the water level in Lake Wivenhoe rose from approximately EL 67.28 67.10 m AHD to at teast approximately EL 69.33 68.48 m AHD.

### **PARTICULARS**

Lake Wivenhoe water level at <u>6.30am</u> .<del>10.00am</del> on 24 <u>25</u>
 December 2010 - EL <u>67.28</u> <del>67.10</del> m AHD

Lake Wivenhoe water level at 12 pm on 29 December 2010 - EL 69.33 m AHD

Lake Wivenhoe water level at 3.00am on 31 December 2010 - EL 68.48 m AHD

Segwater, Spreadsheet containing Lake Wivenhoe water levels between 1 December 2010 and 31 January 2011, Doc identification number: MAU.500.020.0027.

B. Lake Wivenhoe water level at 3.00am on 31 December 2010 EL 69.93 69.33 m AHD

Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam - October to December 2010, May 2011, p 100.

# Flood Operations

- 184A At all times between 1:00 pm on 24 December 2010 and 7:00 am on 26
  December 2010, a Flood Event (as defined in paragraph 102 above) was occurring.
- 184B Between 1:00 pm on 24 December 2010 and 7:00 am on 26 December 2010, the person or persons rostered on call as Duty Flood Operations

  Engineer (as defined in paragraph 99 above) did not mobilise the Flood Operations Centre or commence Flood Operations.

## **PARTICULARS**

- A. The plaintiff is presently unaware of which of the Flood Engineers

  acted as the Duty Flood Engineer during this period. Further

  particulars may be provided after discovery.
- 185 Segwater and SunWater mobilised the Flood Operations Centre at or around 7:00 am on 26 December 2010.

- A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam October to December 2010, May 2011, p 13.
- 186 The Flood Engineers worked the following shifts in the period 26 December 2010 to 2 January 2011:

· ."		
Sunday 26/12/10 07:00	Sunday 26/12/10 19:00	Mr Ayre
Sunday 26/12/10 19:00	Monday 27/12/10 07:00	Mr Tibaldi
Monday 27/12/10 07:00	Monday 27/12/10 19:00	Mr Malone

Shiv Shir Time		:
Monday 27/12/10 19:00	Tuesday 28/12/10 07:00	Mr Tibaldi
Tuesday 28/12/10 07:00	Tuesday 28/12/10 19:00	Mr Malone
Tuesday 28/12/10 19:00	Wednesday 29/12/10 07:00	Mr Ruffini
Wednesday 29/12/10 07:00	Wednesday 29/12/10 19:00	Mr Malone
Wednesday 29/12/10 19:00	Thursday 30/12/10 07:00	Mr Ayre
Thursday 30/12/10 07:00	Thursday 30/12/10 19:00	Mr Malone
Thursday 30/12/10 19:00	Friday 31/12/10 07:00	Mr Ruffini
Friday 31/12/10 07:00	Friday 31/12/10 19:00	Mr Malone
Friday 31/12/10 19:00	Saturday 01/01/11 07:00	Mr Ruffini
Saturday 01/01/11 07:00	Saturday 01/01/11 19:00	Mr Malone
Saturday 01/01/11 19:00	Sunday 02/01/11 07:00	Mr Ayre
Sunday 02/01/11 07:00	Sunday 02/01/11 9:45	Mr Malone

### 187 At or around 9:00 am on 26 December 2010:

- a) the water level in Lake Wivenhoe was approximately EL 67.30 m AHD;
- b) the water level in Lake Somerset was approximately EL 99.50 m AHD; and
- c) the Flood Engineers, or one or more of them, commenced releasing water from Somerset Dam and Wivenhoe Dam at flow rates consistent with Strategy W1 at Wivenhoe Dam and Strategy S2 at Somerset Dam.

## **PARTICULARS**

A. Segwater, Report on the Operation of Somerset and Wivenhoe Dam - October to December 2010, May 2011, pp 100-101, 119, 121.